

DRAFT Comparative Analysis

ACCESS ROAD ALTERNATIVES

<u>Proposal Description:</u>	<u>Causeway #1</u>	<u>Causeway #2 & #3</u>	<u>Dune Road</u>	<u>Dune and At-grade road</u>	<u>Berm/Culverts</u>	<u>Low Causeway</u>	<u>Emergency Access Route</u>	
General:	SFHA	#2 - SFHA moved Inland 50-100' #3 – West end only moved inland	Manmade dune with road on inland side Dune migrates inland 2+ feet/ year Requires reconstruction every 10 years	Road behind, and partially on, dune Dune : 460' x 113' Road: 700' x 25'	Raised roadway with culverts near Pond. 4 – 6 feet high No manmade dune	Alignment as berm/culverts 4 – 6 feet high	Road/bridges over Great Isl. or other location (Only as addition. to other alts.) 3,500' x 20'??	
Size:	400' x 20' wide	#2 – 460' x 20' wide #3 – 440' x 20'	460' x 123' at base	Dune : 460' x 113' Road: 700' x 25'	600' x 40'	600' x 20'		
Properties Traversed	SFHA, VOLF, & Town	#2 – Same as #1 #2 – adds 17.4	Same as #1 + 17.4	Adds 17.3	Same as #1 + either 17.3 or 17.4		Several	
No. of Lanes	2	2	1	1	2	2	1	
<i>Foe all alternatives the roadway can be either one or two lanes. One-lane roadways are likely to require traffic controls.</i>								
<u>Potential to Meet Goals:</u>								
Access: Reliability	OK	OK	Feasibility of 10' roadway is questionable Potential interruption of Access Annually as dune migrates When reconstruction needed (10 yrs.)		Potential Interruption with severe storms ??:	OK	NA	
Property availability	Ok	Potential Issue	OK	OK	Potential Issue	Potential Issue	?????	
<i>Potential issue = Property owners of lots 17.3 and 17.4 have stated that they will sell/lease their properties for the dune alternative, but not for any other alternative.</i>								
Beach: Expansion	Yes	Yes	Unlikely	Unlikely	Probably	Probably	NA	
<i>Likely only if parties involved are comfortable that access alternative is reliable.</i>								
Enhancement front of existing parking lot	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA	
Access to beach			<i>Depends on location of parking lot</i>					

Environmental Impacts:

Wetlands:	20-24 piles	24-28 piles	5,000 SF initially, plus 5-10,000 SF every 10 yrs.	5,000 SF for road, and 5-10,000 SF for dune every 10 yrs.	5,000 SF	
	Shadows	Shadows				Water crossing 300-400 feet
Runoff to Pond:	From causeway 7,200 SF	8,000 SF	From dune = 25,000 SF (60' wide x 420' long)	25,000 SF dune + 5,500 SF from road		
Coastal dune impacts:	Widened access road 4,000 SF	4,000 SF	-	-	-	10,000 SF
Marshland, etc.	26-30 piles	22-26 piles	20,000-25,000 SF	20,000-25,000 +	Small area	Portion of 10,000 SF
Endangered species						
Beach expansion		Could be negotiated with any access alternative				
Pond access	Yes	Yes	?	?	?	
Overland water Flow	Over area of former parking		Restricted by dune	Restricted by dune	Area of former parking lot	
Durability	SW abutment Questionable	OK	Requires annual maintenance plus periodic major reconstruction		May require reconstruction	Annual maintenance

Approvals:

Wetlands		Minor issues	Major issues	Major + issues	Some issues	Major issues
Other						

Visual Impacts:

View of causeway	View of manmade dune with road on it	View of dune and a separate roadway only	View of roadway on berm	View of bridge
	Seen fully by 8 houses, partially by 3. All these houses now view existing parking lot			Seen by ?

Property Requirements:

None	Lot 17-4	Lot 17-4 Lots 17-3 & 17.4	Lot 17.3 or 17.4
------	----------	---------------------------	------------------

Categories of Concern Causeway 1 Causeway 2 Dune Road At Grade Berm/Culverts Emergency. Route

Constructability:

Noise	Pile driving		Truck traffic (initially & periodically		-	
Maintenance	Minimal		Annual or oftener when severe storms		After severe storms	Annual
Reconstruction	No		Every 10 years		Possibly?	

Financial:

Initial cost	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$
Annual cost	0	0	\$\$	\$\$	\$	\$
Periodic cost	small	small	\$\$	\$\$	\$	\$
Payer	SFHA	SFHA	?	?	SFHA	?
Beach permit rev.*	+\$	+\$	\$	\$?	
State funds avail.						
Impact on Town finances						

*Notes: *assumes expanded beach is part of SFHA deal.*

Draft 10/19/2014